

Systematic notes on Asian birds. 8.

The types of *Turdinus kalulongae* Sharpe, 1893, a synonym of *Malacopteron magnirostre cinereocapillum* (Salvadori, 1868)

E.C. Dickinson

Dickinson, E.C. Systematic notes on Asian birds. 8. The types of *Turdinus kalulongae* Sharpe, 1893, a synonym of *Malacopteron magnirostre cinereocapillum* (Salvadori, 1868).

Edward C. Dickinson, c/o The Trust for Oriental Ornithology, Flat 3, Bolsover Court, 19 Bolsover Road, Eastbourne BN20 7JG, U.K. (e-mail: asiaorn@ftech.co.uk).

Keywords: *Turdinus kalulongae*; types; lectotype; ICZN.

Two types of *Turdinus kalulongae* Sharpe, 1893, exist. The specimen at Tring is a lectotype, not a holotype as listed. The designation was indirect but consistent with the Rules of the International Code of Zoological Nomenclature. The case well illustrates the preciseness of the applicability of the Rules in action.

Introduction

Between 1875 and 1894, Sharpe published a long series of papers on the birds of Borneo (Smythies, 1957) and the list given by Smythies excluded the preliminary papers containing new descriptions that appeared in the Bulletin of the British Ornithologists' Club. Sharpe examined material from Alfred Everett and his brother, from collections stimulated by Ussher and Treacher (whose collectors included Low, Burbidge and Veitch), from John Whitehead, and from Charles Hose and his brother.

The important material from the major collection by John Whitehead on Mt Kinabalu, which formed the basis for Sharpe's seven part paper on 'Northern Borneo' (Sharpe, 1889, 1890), went to the Rothschild Museum and is now in the American Museum of Natural History, New York (AMNH). However, it was not always made clear by Sharpe that the types would be going to the Rothschild Museum and in view of Sharpe's affiliations with the British Museum one might have supposed they would be in the British Museum (Natural History) and now be at the Natural History Museum, Tring (BMNH).

In 1893 Sharpe, now familiar with the birds of the Mt Kinabalu area (now in Sabah, eastern Malaysia), described *Turdinus kalulongae* (the original spelling employed a diphthong) from Mt Kalulong, in eastern Sarawak, collected by Charles Hose. This name is now to be found in the synonymy of *Malacopteron magnirostre cinereocapillum* (Salvadori, 1868).

Two specimens were taken (Sharpe, 1893) but this was not made clear in the original description, and no type specimen was designated. Subsequently, Warren & Harrison (1971) listed BMNH 1893.6.21.3 as the holotype, but this was either a presumption of uniqueness or it was understood that one should be a paratype and one the holotype, but it was not explained why this one had been selected. It is clear from the accession date that this specimen, and only this specimen of this taxon, was obtained by the BMNH at the time that Sharpe described it. This supports the view that the reasoning of Warren & Harrison (1971) was a presumption of uniqueness.

Discussion

In reviewing the type cards at the AMNH in late 1997 the author noted that a second specimen (AMNH 589156) was held there that had also been thought to be a type of *Turdinus kalulonga*. Reference to the original description showed that Sharpe (1893) had acknowledged the existence of two specimens, although he did not state that he had the two before him. It was therefore appropriate to reassess the situation.

The BM specimen has a red type label, on this the text confirms that the specimen was purchased from E. Gerrard, a well-known dealer. Hose's own label simply says "male, Feb." and, on the back in a different handwriting (apparently Sharpe's), "Type *Turdinus kalulonga*". This no doubt reassured Warren & Harrison but under the terms of Arts. 73.1.3. and 74.6 of the International Code for Zoological Nomenclature (ICZN, 1999) this is incorrect (see also Recommendation 73F).

Hose's label on the specimen in the AMNH, received as part of the Rothschild Collection, has "co-type *kalulonga*" on it in pencil. Hartert (1920) reported this as written "by the author" and presumably meant Sharpe rather than himself, and he went on to say "we now call it a paratype". This unambiguous statement is consistent with the meaning of Art. 74.5 of the International Code of Zoological Nomenclature and constitutes a sufficient designation of the only other type specimen, that in the BMNH, recently considered a holotype, as a lectotype. The second part of the same Article makes clear why the listing of it as a holotype by Warren & Harrison would not have been sufficient to meet the required criteria.

In the circumstances of Hartert's decision and publication it has not seemed necessary to directly compare what is thought to be Sharpe's handwriting on the two labels. The cardex at the AMNH has been annotated with clear notes on Hartert's decision.

The specimen now in Tring should therefore be treated as the lectotype of *Turdinus kalulonga* Sharpe, 1893, designated by Hartert (1920) and the specimen in New York treated as a paralectotype.

Acknowledgements

This paper has developed as part of on-going collaboration with Mary LeCroy of the American Museum of Natural History, New York. She is continuing the development and publication of the Museum's detailed Type Catalogue and this work has coincided with a search by the author for details of the types of Asian birds for inclusion in a planned 'Synopsis of the Birds of Asia'. I am most grateful to Mary for her assistance in unravelling these cases.

I should also like to thank Dr George Barrowclough of the AMNH for his welcome to his Department and both him and Mary for their assistance in obtaining for the author a Collection Study Grant from the Museum, as well as the assistance of Paula Polimeni in the AMNH Office of Grants and Fellowships.

At the Natural History Museum, Tring, I have been encouraged in my review of type material by Dr Robert Prys-Jones and assisted by discussions on types and their status both in general and in particular cases by Michael Walters. I am also indebted to René Dekker in Leiden, to Drs Jean-François and Claire Voisin in Paris, and to Dr

Pamela Rasmussen of the Smithsonian Institution, Washington DC, and other friends at earlier points in time, for similar discussions all of which have increased my confidence in dealing with such matters.

Grateful thanks are also due to Mary LeCroy for reading the paper in draft and commenting.

References

- Hartert, E., 1920. Types of birds in the Tring Museum. B. Types in the General Collection.— Novit. Zool. 27: 425-505.
- ICZN, 1999. International Code for Zoological Nomenclature (4th ed): i-xxix, 1-306.— London.
- Salvadori, T., 1868. Nuove specie di uccelli di Borneo.— Atti R. Accad. Sci. Torino 3(6): 524-533.
- Sharpe, R.B., 1889. On the ornithology of northern Borneo.— Ibis (Ser. 6) 1: 63-85, 185-205, 265-283, 409-443.
- Sharpe, R.B., 1890. On the ornithology of northern Borneo.— Ibis (Ser. 6) 2: 1-24, 133-149, 273-292.
- Sharpe, R.B. 1893. [*Turdinus kalulongæ* sp. n.].— Bull. Brit. Orn. Cl. 1(10): 54.
- Smythies, B.E. 1957. An annotated checklist of the birds of Borneo.— Sarawak Mus. J. 7: i-xv, 523-818.
- Warren R.M. & C.J.O. Harrison, 1971. Type-specimens of birds in the British Museum (Natural History). Vol. 2. Passerines: i-vi, 1-628.— London.

Received: 28.ix.1999 (first draft), 24.i.2000 (final draft)

Accepted: 17.ii.2000

Edited: C. van Achterberg

